EVALUATION OF PROJECT-BASED LEARNING IMPLEMENTATION TO ENCOURAGE STUDENT CREATIVITY AND INNOVATION

Robby Cahyadi *[1]
Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang
robycahyadi924@gmail.com

Moh. Imron Rosidi
Universitas Negeri Gorontalo, Indonesia
mohimronrosidi@ung.ac.id

Nanang Abdillah
Institut Al Azhar Menganti Gresik
nangabdillah@gmail.com

Abstract

Project-Based Learning (PBL) has been recognized as an effective approach to enrich the learning process by providing students with opportunities for in-depth exploration of real-world problems. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the implementation of PBL in enhancing students' creativity and innovation. This research examines how PBL can encourage students to develop critical thinking, collaboration and problem-solving skills that are relevant to the needs of today's working world. This study used the literature research method. The results show that PBL is successful in creating a more dynamic learning environment and stimulating student creativity. In many cases, students who engage in project-based learning show significant improvement in terms of the ability to think critically and innovatively. In addition, PBL also encourages the development of important 21st century skills such as teamwork, communication and independence. This study found that one of the keys to the success of PBL in enhancing students' creativity and innovation lies in the ability of educators to provide comprehensive challenges to students and keep them engaged in the learning process. However, challenges such as teacher readiness and limited learning time in some contexts are points that require further attention to maximize the effectiveness of PBL.

Keywords: Evaluation, Implementation of Project-Based Learning, Student Creativity and Innovation.

Introduction

In the era of globalization and increasingly fierce competition, creativity and innovation are important keys in shaping students' character and ability to compete and succeed in the future. Creativity is no longer seen as a talent possessed by a handful of individuals, but as a competency that can be developed through the right learning process. Similarly, innovation is needed to find solutions to new problems that continue to emerge with the times.

---

[1] Correspondence author.

Creativity and innovation have become a major focus in education as an integral part of the 21st century skills that students must possess to adapt to future changes and challenges (Thornhill-Miller et al., 2023). In a rapidly changing world due to technological advances and globalization, students are not only expected to absorb knowledge, but also to apply creative and innovative thinking in solving complex problems (Putra et al., 2020). Education that focuses on creativity and innovation encourages students to cross conventional boundaries of knowledge, explore new solutions, and realize ideas that can make significant contributions to improving the quality of human life and social progress (Ekizer & Yildirim, 2023).

In addition, creativity and innovation are key to success in the job market. Contemporary employers and industries are looking for individuals who not only have technical competence, but also the ability to think outside the box, adapt to changing situations, and create innovations that can improve efficiency, productivity, and generate added value for companies and society (Zhang & Hwang, 2023). Therefore, through education, it is important to instill the ability to think divergently, collaborate, communicate effectively, and develop intrapersonal skills so that students can innovate and contribute positively in this unpredictable world (Santhosh et al., 2023). An education system that supports creativity and innovation not only prepares them to become adaptive members of the workforce but also molds them into independent thinkers capable of pushing the boundaries of science and advancing the well-being of humanity (Aslan et al., 2020).

Traditional education systems that are generally passive and teacher-centered are often insufficient in encouraging creativity and innovation among students. In response, many educational institutions have started to adopt project-based learning approaches (Tubagus et al., 2023). Project-based learning is a methodology that enhances students' active involvement in the learning process through the completion of real problem-oriented projects. This approach can facilitate deeper learning, develop critical thinking skills, and increase students' motivation and initiative in coming up with new ideas (Ng et al., 2023).

Project-based learning (PjBL) is an innovative teaching approach where students are directly involved in the learning process through investigating, designing and implementing projects that address real problems in their learning environment. This method focuses on developing practical skills that are relevant to students, as well as preparing them to be able to adapt and be productive in a changing society and workplace (Ilma et al., 2023). In PjBL, learning is no longer just based on theory delivered by the teacher unilaterally, but rather on students' direct experience in carrying out projects that require them to apply knowledge to real situations, collaborate with peers, and interact with related communities or industries. This approach supports the development of students' independence, enhances their critical thinking skills, and encourages creativity and innovation (Abelenda et al., 2023).

The advantages of project-based learning are not only limited to the development of academic skills; more so, this method promotes the growth of social and emotional skills, such as teamwork, communication, resilience, and decision-making (Williams et al., 2023). It creates a dynamic learning environment where students are encouraged to become more responsible towards their own learning, navigate challenges by developing innovative solutions, and reflect on their experiences for continuous improvement (Fuldiaratman & Ekaputra, 2023). Through this holistic approach, project-based learning prepares students not only for academic success, but also develops their readiness for the future, both as competent individuals in the job market and as active and empowered members of society (Khasanah, 2024).

However, the extent to which the implementation of project-based learning can effectively enhance students' creativity and innovation is not yet fully understood. This raises the need to further evaluate the implementation of this method in different educational contexts. This evaluation is important to understand the factors that influence the success of this learning method and how it can be improved to support the development of student creativity and innovation (Krajcik et al., 2023).

Given this importance, it would be beneficial to evaluate the implementation of project-based learning by utilizing existing literature studies. This study is expected to provide insights into the best practices and challenges commonly faced in project-based learning, as well as provide recommendations for improving the implementation of this learning going forward.

Through a comprehensive literature review, this study aims to collect data that can help teachers, educators, and policy makers in designing and implementing effective learning strategies to foster students' creativity and innovation. Thus, students can be better prepared to face future challenges and play an active role in creating innovations that have a positive impact on society.

Research Methods

The research method conducted in this study is literature. The literature research method is an approach used to collect, identify, and analyze data available through written sources such as books, journal articles, reports, and other documents relevant to the research topic (Sio et al., 2024). This process usually involves selecting relevant literature, critically reviewing the content, and synthesizing the information to draw conclusions or build a theoretical basis for the research. This technique is often used in various academic fields to explore existing theory and practice, as well as to identify gaps in existing research that can be used as a basis for further study (Nguyen et al., 2024).

The literature review research method helps researchers develop a deep understanding of the context and nuances of the topic under study, which makes it very important, especially in the early stages of developing a research proposal or when conducting an exploratory study (Kim et al., 2024).

Results and Discussion
Project-based Learning Theory

Project-based learning (PBL) is a pedagogical method that emphasizes student learning through hands-on experience in designing, planning and implementing projects that address real-world problems or significant questions (Hardie et al., 2023). In this learning model, students are positioned as the center of learning, where they are actively involved in the process of investigation and reflection, enabling them to develop and apply cross-disciplinary knowledge and skills in a coherent context. Project Based Learning is designed to enrich students' understanding in a contextualized way, giving them the opportunity to work in teams, hone communication skills, develop creativity, and problem-solving skills (Umar et al., 2023). Through projects that are relevant to real life, students can connect what they learn in the classroom with the outside world, so that learning becomes a meaningful and sustainable experience (Hendriarto et al., 2021).

Key characteristics of Project-Based Learning include an emphasis on deep and meaningful guiding questions, the selection of projects that are authentic and relevant to the students' world, and the active role of students in the learning process. The projects are designed to require critical skills such as collaboration, communication, and creative thinking, which are essential skills for success in the 21st century (Byron et al., 2023). In addition, evaluation in PBL often includes ongoing formative assessment by teachers and self-reflection by students, highlighting the learning process as well as the final product of the project. This approach ensures that students do not only pursue the end result, but also prioritize the learning process itself, including effective planning, teamwork, and adaptive responses to issues that arise during project implementation (Gallagher & Savage, 2023).

Through the implementation of Project Based Learning, students are engaged in a dynamic and adaptive learning process, which encourages them to take initiative and responsibility for their own learning. This process allows them to explore various disciplines, integrate knowledge and skills from various sources, and apply them in a practical and relevant context (Beemt et al., 2023). Thus, PBL not only hones academic skills, but also enhances vital competencies such as interpersonal skills, ability to manage resources, information literacy, and adaptability to changing environments. This learning approach gives students the opportunity to work with their peers, share knowledge and gain hands-on experience in overcoming challenges. This not only equips students with specific subject knowledge, but also prepares them for future lives and careers by teaching them how to learn effectively and collaborate in teams (Setyosari et al., 2023).

In conclusion, Project-Based Learning is an effective and multifaceted teaching strategy, which stimulates students' academic and personal growth by bringing together critical aspects of student-centered learning, collaboration, and practical application of knowledge. With a focus on developing skills relevant to real life, PBL encourages students to become lifelong learners capable of navigating the complexities of the world with confidence. Through personalized and contextualized learning experiences, students are

expected to not only achieve academic excellence, but also become conscious, critical, and contributing members of society. In this era of globalization and rapid technological change, learning that encourages innovation, adaptability, and cooperation is crucial, and PBL uniquely provides an adequate platform for the development of these skills.

Creativity and Innovation in Education

Project-Based Learning (PBL) is an educational methodology that emphasizes learning activities through challenging and authentic projects as the center of the teaching and learning process. In this approach, students are given the opportunity to explore real and relevant problems, allowing them to develop deeper understanding and apply what they have learned in real situations (Weng et al., 2023). PBL not only prioritizes learning outcomes in the form of products or final answers, but also creative and analytical processes involving decision-making, research, collaboration and effective communication. It is a holistic and interdisciplinary approach, which actively engages students in the learning process and gives them more control over their learning (Qiu et al., 2023).

In the context of 21st century education, when the world is undergoing rapid and complex changes, skills such as problem solving, critical thinking, collaboration, and adaptability are crucial. Project-based learning facilitates the development of these skills by presenting challenges similar to what students will encounter in the real world. As such, PBL not only assists students in understanding course content more deeply, but also develops confidence, collaboration ability, and communication skills - all important aspects needed for future success (Ananda et al., 2023). Project Based Learning is therefore highly relevant and critical in preparing students for life and careers in the 21st century, creating learners who not only know a lot, but can also do a lot with the knowledge they have.

Creativity and innovation are important aspects that drive progress in many fields, from the arts to technology and business. Various factors can influence a person's capacity to innovate and create, of which environment is one of the most important (Firmansyah et al., 2023). A supportive environment, such as a workplace or educational space that encourages free thinking, questioning and experimentation, can stimulate creativity. In addition, the availability of resources, be it time, information or material resources, also plays a crucial role. Social support from colleagues, mentors, or educators who provide constructive feedback and encourage calculated risks, also greatly increases the capacity to innovate. An environment that provides the freedom to fail and learn from mistakes without fear of punishment tends to breed new ideas and innovative approaches (Karamustafaoğlu & Pektaş, 2023).

On the other hand, internal factors such as motivation, self-confidence, and readiness to accept challenges are also crucial. Individuals who have intrinsic motivation, or motivation that comes from within themselves to create or solve problems, tend to be more creative (Abdurrahman & Mahmudah, 2023). Similarly, confidence to implement new ideas and readiness to accept and learn from failure are key aspects of personality that can

enhance innovation. In addition, experience and knowledge in various fields also broaden one's thinking horizons, making him or her better able to connect seemingly unrelated concepts to come up with creative solutions. Therefore, education and diverse life experiences can be valuable assets in enhancing creativity and innovation (Ardiansah & Zulfiani, 2023).

The effect of project-based learning on student creativity

Project-based learning (PBL) significantly influences students' creativity by providing a supportive platform for them to generate and develop new ideas. In the context of PBL, students are tasked with completing complex and often real-world problem-oriented projects, which require them to think beyond conventional boundaries and seek innovative solutions (Utami et al., 2023). PBL encourages students to research, question and apply their knowledge in ways they have never done before, which in itself is a creative process. This learning experience allows students to explore multiple lines of thought, integrate insights from different lessons, and look at problems from different perspectives, all while collaborating with their peers, which can trigger original thinking and enrich the creative process (Hidayati et al., 2023).

Projects developed in PBL are often multidisciplinary in nature, providing opportunities for students to act as designers, researchers and innovators, acting in an environment similar to what they would face in the real world (Khalaf & Alshammari, 2023). Through the application of concepts and theories into practice, students not only gain a deeper understanding of the learning material, but also learn how to combine different aspects of knowledge to create something unique. Thus, PBL not only encourages creativity, but also hones students' ability to apply that creativity in producing innovations. A project-focused learning environment challenges students to take initiative and pursue their ideas through to concrete outcomes, fostering confidence in their ability to create and innovate (Rushiana et al., 2023).

Furthermore, through the project-based learning process, students are taught to see failure as part of the learning process. When encountering obstacles or results that are not as expected, students learn to evaluate and revise their approach. This skill is a key component in creative thinking, as it helps in the development of resilience and flexibility of thought (Abelenda et al., 2023). This experience also instills the understanding that creativity often requires continuous iteration and experimentation. PBL approaches often incorporate individual and group reflection, which allows students to consider what worked, what didn't, and how their strategies can be improved in the future to produce innovative solutions (Qiu et al., 2023).

Thus, project-based learning has a strong positive impact on students' creativity. PBL encourages discovery through action, problem-solving skills, collaboration, and critical skills that enable students to connect school knowledge with real-world challenges. The supportive environment of PBL facilitates the growth of students' creative skills by providing them with valuable opportunities to fully develop their thought processes, from

initial concept to project execution. Through the application of theory into practice, students become more adept at innovating and thinking creatively, which is not only important for their success in school, but also in their future professional and personal lives.

The effect of project-based learning on student innovation

Project-based learning (PBL) exerts a strong influence on student innovativeness as it supports the development of various skills essential to the innovative process. PBL gives students the opportunity to be actively involved in the learning process, where they are given the freedom to explore, experiment and apply knowledge in complex and often unpredictable situations (Aslan & Shiong, 2023). This helps in fostering original thinking, ensuring that students not only explore conventional solutions, but also propose innovative new solutions. With a focus on problem-solving and critical thinking, students learn to approach problems from multiple perspectives, analyze data, combine information from multiple sources, and use these insights to design innovative solutions. PBL challenges students to go beyond mere reception of knowledge, encouraging them to become creators and innovators of their own knowledge (Jiang & Pang, 2023).

Specifically, PBL promotes innovation among students by allowing them to work on ongoing projects, which are often customized to their interests or needs. It trains students to develop skills such as collaboration, communication, project management and leadership, all of which are crucial for successful innovation (Saimon et al., 2023). When working in teams, students learn to include and value different perspectives, which fosters innovation through the synergy of new and diverse ideas. In generating solutions, students have the opportunity to use the latest technologies, tools and methodologies required in the innovative process. Through continuous practice, mistakes and reflection, PBL not only instills a culture of innovation, but also teaches students the importance of perseverance and adaptability, invaluable qualities for future innovators (Llach & Bastida, 2023).

Furthermore, project-based learning instills in students an appreciation of the continuous process of learning and innovation, rather than just a focus on the end result. Students learn that every idea, no matter how small, can be a starting point for innovation. Meeting real-world challenges in a classroom environment provides valuable insights into how theory relates to practice and how innovation can be a tool to solve real problems. This approach teaches students that innovation does not always involve very large or revolutionary inventions; sometimes, the most impactful changes come from small, continuous improvements (DeCoito & Briona, 2023).

The freedom afforded in PBL allows students to explore and develop at their own pace, which is crucial to the innovative process. This opportunity to experiment and take risks in a supportive environment, without fear of failure, is invaluable in the development of innovative attitudes (Garcia, 2023). Failure and constructive feedback are seen as a natural part of the learning and innovation process, which helps shape students into resilient thinkers, ready to face future challenges and problems (Nurdiana et al., 2023).

In conclusion, the effect of project-based learning on student innovation is very significant. Through PBL methodology, students are not only enriched with theoretical knowledge, but also with practical skills needed for innovation. This approach encourages creativity, critical thinking, teamwork, and adaptability-all essential skills in an ever-changing world that requires innovative solutions to complex problems. Project-based learning prepares students not only for success on the next rung of the educational ladder but also in the workplace and personal life, making them future innovators who will take our society in a better direction.

Conclusion

Evaluation of project-based learning (PBL) implementation shows that this method has an important role in developing creativity and innovation among students. PBL encourages self-directed learning and responsibility for one's own educational process, training students to become critical and solution thinkers. Through direct application in real relevant projects, students gain the ability to reflect and apply their knowledge in the real world. This not only enhances critical reasoning, but also provides the impetus for students to explore new and innovative ways of problem solving. Constant evaluation and feedback on their work hones students' ability to think analytically and consider diverse alternatives before making a decision or prototyping a solution.

In addition, collaboration, a key element of PBL, serves as a major catalyst in the creative process, by providing opportunities for students to learn from different perspectives and appreciate the value of teamwork in the innovation process. Ultimately, PBL effectively prepares students to become a competent and innovative workforce of the future, with the skills required in a knowledge-based global economy. The ability to combine, apply and evaluate different types of knowledge and skills becomes an asset that they can carry throughout their professional careers. Thus, the implementation of PBL not only contributes to students' intellectual development but also substantially influences their ability to create, innovate, and adapt in an ever-changing environment.

References

Abdurrahman, I., & Mahmudah, F. (2023). Development of a Digital-Preneurship Measurement Instrument: Alignment Approach through Project-Based Learning. *International Journal of Educational …*, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1378741

Abelenda, A., Aiouache, F., & … (2023). Adapted business model canvas template and primary market research for project-based learning on management of slurry. *… Technology &Innovation*, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2352186423001025

Ananda, L., Rahmawati, Y., & Khairi, F. (2023). Critical Thinking Skills of Chemistry Students by Integrating Design Thinking with STEAM-PjBL. *… of Technology and Science Education*, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1391986

Ardiansah, R., & Zulfiani, Z. (2023). Development of interactive e-LKPD based on creative thinking skills on the concept of environmental change. *JPBI (Jurnal Pendidikan*

Biologi ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11. https://ejournal.umm.ac.id/index.php/jpbi/article/view/22389

Aslan, A., & Shiong, P. K. (2023). Learning in the Digital Age Full of Hedonistic Cultural Values Among Elementary School Students. *Bulletin of Pedagogical Research*, *3*(2), Article 2. https://doi.org/10.51278/bpr.v3i2.515

Aslan, A., Silvia, S., Nugroho, B. S., Ramli, M., & Rusiadi, R. (2020). TEACHER'S LEADERSHIP TEACHING STRATEGY SUPPORTING STUDENT LEARNING DURING THE COVID-19 DISRUPTION. *Nidhomul Haq : Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, *5*(3), Article 3. https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v5i3.984

Beemt, A. van den, Watering, G. van de, & ... (2023). Conceptualising variety in challenge-based learning in higher education: The CBL-compass. *... Engineering Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1080/03043797.2022.2078181

Byron, K., Keem, S., Darden, T., Shalley, C., & ... (2023). Building blocks of idea generation and implementation in teams: A meta-analysis of team design and team creativity and innovation. *Personnel ...*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1111/peps.12501

DeCoito, I., & Briona, L. (2023). Fostering an entrepreneurial mindset through project-based learning and digital technologies in STEM teacher education. *... Entrepreneurial Mindsets through STEM Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-17816-0_9

Ekizer, F., & Yildirim, S. (2023). 21st Century Skills and Learning Environments: ELT Students' Perceptions. *Educational Research and Reviews*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1392591

Firmansyah, C., Ubaidillah, U., & ... (2023). Design of The "Merdeka Belajar" Program for Students of High School Education. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal ...*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. http://pasca.jurnalikhac.ac.id/index.php/munaddhomah/article/view/328

Fuldiaratman, F., & Ekaputra, F. (2023). Analysis of students' 4c skills based on project based learning through chemo entrepreneurship media. *... of Education and Learning Innovation*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://sainsmat.org/index.php/eduline/article/view/2057

Gallagher, S., & Savage, T. (2023). Challenge-based learning in higher education: An exploratory literature review. *Teaching in Higher Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2020.1863354

Garcia, M. (2023). Fostering an Innovation Culture in the Education Sector: A Scoping Review and Bibliometric Analysis of Hackathon Research. *Innovative Higher Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10755-023-09651-y

Hardie, B., Highfield, C., & Lee, K. (2023). Attitudes and values of teachers and leaders towards entrepreneurship education. *Research Papers in Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1080/02671522.2022.2028891

Hendriarto, P., Mursidi, A., Kalbuana, N., Aini, N., & Aslan, A. (2021). Understanding the Implications of Research Skills Development Framework for Indonesian Academic Outcomes Improvement. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, *6*(2), Article 2. https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v6i2.1405

Hidayati, D., Novianti, H., Khansa, M., & ... (2023). Effectiveness project-based learning in esp class: Viewed from indonesian students 'learning outcomes. *... and Education ...*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Joko-

Slamet/publication/369165757_Effectiveness_Project-Based_Learning_in_ESP_Class_Viewed_from_Indonesian_Students'_Learning_Outcomes/links/64b8f475c41fb852dd869cf6/Effectiveness-Project-Based-Learning-in-ESP-Class-Viewed-from-Indonesian-Students-Learning-Outcomes.pdf

Ilma, A., Wilujeng, I., Nurtanto, M., & … (2023). A Systematic Literature Review of STEM Education in Indonesia (2016-2021): Contribution to Improving Skills in 21st Century Learning. … *Journal of Education and …*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://www.pegegog.net/index.php/pegegog/article/view/1725

Jiang, C., & Pang, Y. (2023). Enhancing design thinking in engineering students with project-based learning. … *Applications in Engineering Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1002/cae.22608

Karamustafaoğlu, O., & Pektaş, H. (2023). Developing students' creative problem solving skills with inquiry-based STEM activity in an out-of-school learning environment. *Education and Information Technologies*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-022-11496-5

Khalaf, M., & Alshammari, A. (2023). Effects of Project-Based Learning on Postgraduate Students' Research Proposal Writing Skills. *European Journal of Educational …*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope=site&authtype=crawler&jrnl=21658714&AN=162633142&h=lOzMLh4qqo89SZsFz1QqTY5SGmUR%2BPe2Hj7J5okV4vCxTSfmP0NU7YA64tJM6eSwXjQ6pnq85X2aRbuN2Pa3rA%3D%3D&crl=c

Khasanah, U. (2024). Developing Contextual Textbooks of Islamic Religious Education on Curriculum Development and Innovation Course. *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education*, *8*(1), 267–267. https://doi.org/10.35723/ajie.v8i1.453

Kim, K., Lee, K., & Kwon, O. (2024). A systematic literature review of the empirical studies on STEAM education in Korea: 2011–2019. *Disciplinary and Interdisciplinary Education in …*, *Query date: 2024-05-10 07:14:07*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-52924-5_6

Krajcik, J., Schneider, B., Miller, E., & … (2023). Assessing the effect of project-based learning on science learning in elementary schools. … *Educational …*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312221129247

Llach, M. C., & Bastida, M. L. (2023). Exploring innovative strategies in problem based learning to contribute to sustainable development: A case study. … *Sustainability in Higher Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-07-2021-0296

Ng, D., Lee, M., Tan, R., Hu, X., Downie, J., & … (2023). A review of AI teaching and learning from 2000 to 2020. *Education and …*, *Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-022-11491-w

Nguyen, D., Boeren, E., Maitra, S., & … (2024). A review of the empirical research literature on PLCs for teachers in the Global South: Evidence, implications, and directions. … *Development in Education*, *Query date: 2024-05-10 07:14:07*. https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2023.2238728

Nurdiana, R., Effendi, M. N., Ningsih, K. P., Abda, M. I., & Aslan, A. (2023). COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIPS FOR DIGITAL EDUCATION TO IMPROVE STUDENTS' LEARNING ACHIEVEMENT AT THE INSTITUTE OF ISLAMIC RELIGION OF SULTAN MUHAMMAD SYAFIUDDIN SAMBAS, INDONESIA. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning*, *1*(1), Article 1.

Putra, P., Liriwati, F. Y., Tahrim, T., Syafrudin, S., & Aslan, A. (2020). The Students Learning from Home Experiences during Covid-19 School Closures Policy In Indonesia. *Jurnal Iqra' : Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 5(2), Article 2. https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v5i2.1019

Qiu, Y., García-Aracil, A., & Isusi-Fagoaga, R. (2023). Critical issues and trends in innovation and entrepreneurship education in higher education in the post-COVID-19 era in China and Spain. *Education Sciences, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://www.mdpi.com/2227-7102/13/4/407

Rushiana, R., Sumarna, O., & Anwar, S. (2023). Efforts to develop students' critical thinking skills in chemistry learning: Systematic literature review. *... Penelitian Pendidikan IPA, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Ruci-Rushiana/publication/369689541_Efforts_to_Develop_Students'_Critical_Thinking _Skills_in_Chemistry_Learning_Systematic_Literature_Review/links/6427a12a315d fb4ccec33623/Efforts-to-Develop-Students-Critical-Thinking-Skills-in-Chemistry-Learning-Systematic-Literature-Review.pdf

Saimon, M., Lavicza, Z., & Dana-Picard, T. (2023). Enhancing the 4Cs among college students of a communication skills course in Tanzania through a project-based learning model. *Education and Information ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-022-11406-9

Santhosh, M., Farooqi, H., Ammar, M., Siby, N., & ... (2023). A Meta-Analysis to Gauge the Effectiveness of STEM Informal Project-Based Learning: Investigating the Potential Moderator Variables. *... of Science Education ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://doi.org/10.1007/s10956-023-10063-y

Setyosari, P., Kuswandi, D., & Ulfa, S. (2023). Creative problem solving process instructional design in the context of blended learning in higher education. *... Journal of E-Learning, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://academic-publishing.org/index.php/ejel/article/view/2653

Sio, K., Fraser, B., & Fredline, L. (2024). A contemporary systematic literature review of gastronomy tourism and destination image. *Tourism Recreation Research, Query date: 2024-05-10 07:14:07.* https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2021.1997491

Thornhill-Miller, B., Camarda, A., Mercier, M., & ... (2023). ... , critical thinking, communication, and collaboration: Assessment, certification, and promotion of 21st century skills for the future of work and education. *Journal of ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://www.mdpi.com/2079-3200/11/3/54

Tubagus, M., Haerudin, H., Fathurohman, A., Adiyono, A., & Aslan, A. (2023). THE IMPACT OF TECHNOLOGY ON ISLAMIC PESANTREN EDUCATION AND THE LEARNING OUTCOMES OF SANTRI: NEW TRENDS AND POSSIBILITIES. *Indonesian Journal of Education (INJOE)*, 3(3), Article 3.

Umar, U., Okilanda, A., Suganda, M., & ... (2023). Blended learning and online learning with project-based learning: Do they affect cognition and psycho-motor learning achievement in physical conditions? *... En Educación Física ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=9067696

Utami, W., Kuswandi, D., Soepriyanto, Y., & ... (2023). Development of Online Web Learning with Ethnomatematics Content on Self Regulated Learning. *JTP-Jurnal Teknologi ..., Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/jtp/article/view/31705

Weng, X., Ng, O., Cui, Z., & Leung, S. (2023). Creativity development with problem-based digital making and block-based programming for science, technology, engineering,

arts, and mathematics learning in ... . *Journal of Educational ... , Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://doi.org/10.1177/07356331221115661

Williams, R., Ali, S., Devasia, N., DiPaola, D., Hong, J., & ... (2023). AI+ ethics curricula for middle school youth: Lessons learned from three project-based curricula. *... Intelligence in Education, Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://doi.org/10.1007/s40593-022-00298-y

Zhang, D., & Hwang, G. (2023). ... Peer Assessment and Problem-Solving Tendencies on Students' Learning Achievements and Collaboration in Mobile Technology-Supported Project-Based Learning. *Journal of Educational Computing ... , Query date: 2024-05-18 16:23:11.* https://doi.org/10.1177/07356331221094250